



**Agenda**  
**Special City Council Meeting**

**Call in: 800-356-8278, Code #567032**  
**Wednesday, July 11, 2018**  
**12:00 P.M.**

1. Call To Order By The Mayor
2. 18-207. Review And Approve Agenda
3. 18-208. General Business And Appearances
4. 18-209. Consideration Of The Consent Agenda
  - a. Award Of Construction Contract - Project Title: Montpelier Berlin Bike Path STP BIKE 33(S)

Documents:

[18-209A - BIKE PATH CONTRACT.PDF](#)

5. 18-210. Municipal Tax Rates For FY19

Documents:

[18-210 - TAX RATE.PDF](#)

6. Adjournment



CITY COUNCIL Agenda Item #18-209(a)

Date: July 11, 2018

Consent  Discussion  Time Sensitive

**SUBJECT:** Award of Construction Contract – Project Title: “Montpelier-Berlin Bike Path STP BIKE 33(s)”

**SUBMITTING DEPARTMENT:** Public Works

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** Approve the Award of a Construction Contract to J. Hutchins, Inc. as the Contractor submitting the lowest responsive bid in the amount of \$4,696,668.50 as recommended by the DPW Director and the consulting engineer and as authorized by the VT Agency of Transportation. Designate the City Manager as the duly authorized agent for the City to execute the contract documents, change orders and other contractual documents customary for a project of this type. NOTE: If the VTrans approval of the contract award recommendation is not available at the time of the Council meeting, the award by City Council should be made subject to receipt.

**RELATED COUNCIL GOAL/PRIOR ACTION:** G. Achieve a steady state for infrastructure maintenance and improvements, facilities and equipment (Action: Shared Use Path – Winooski East Extension)

**EXPENDITURE REQUIRED:** Local share = 10% of construction, engineering & inspection services.

**SOURCE OF FUNDS:** CIP & FY19 Bond

**LEGAL REQUIREMENTS:** N/A

**BACKGROUND INFORMATION:** Upon securing all required environmental permits including a land use permit under Act 250, clearing right-of-way with 16 property owners adjoining the shared use path, obtaining funding approval from Federal Highway and our local voters, our final Plans, Specifications & Estimate (PS&E) was approved and authorization to advertise for bids was issued by VTrans on May 21<sup>st</sup>.

The contract was released and publicly advertised for bids on May 29<sup>th</sup> and bids were received and opened at 10:00 am on June 29<sup>th</sup> in accordance with the Instructions to Bidders as amended. Below is a summary of the total base bid amounts as confirmed by the project engineer. All bids have been verified and a bid analysis completed in accordance with Federal Highway and VTrans requirements. Furthermore, the required supplemental documentation was submitted with the bids which has also been verified

including bid bonds, debarment & non-collusion affidavit, contractor project specific pre-qualification, and acknowledgment of receipt of addenda.

- |                                 |                |
|---------------------------------|----------------|
| 1) J. Hutchins, Inc.            | \$4,696,668.50 |
| 2) BUR Construction             | \$4,794,961.50 |
| 3) Engineers Construction, Inc. | \$4,817,510.50 |
| 4) Dubois Construction, Inc.    | \$5,097,366.00 |

Note: One bid rejected due to late submission (10:05 am) - JP Sicard  
Engineer's Cost Estimate: \$5,443,561.11

**SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS:**

Bid Tabulation

Letter from Dubois & King: Recommendation of Award & Bid Analysis

**INTERESTED PARTIES:** Residents, all potential path users including pedestrians, runners and bicyclists in the Granite St – Gallison Hill Rd area,

**CITY MANAGER'S APPROVAL:**



**CITY OF MONTPELIER, VT**  
**MONTPELIER-BERLIN SHARED USE PATH**  
**STP BIKE (33)S**  
**BID TABULATION**

1% threshold \$ 46,966.69

BID OPENING JUNE 29, 2018 - 10:00 AM

| ITEM NO: | DESCRIPTION  | EST QUAN | UNITS | J HUTCHINS INC. |               | BUR CONSTRUCTION |               | ENGINEERS CONSTRUCTION, INC. |               | DuBOIS CONSTRUCTION |               | Engineers Estimate |               | Difference Between Estimate and Low Bid | Do we need to analyze? |
|----------|--|----------|-------|-----------------|---------------|------------------|---------------|------------------------------|---------------|---------------------|---------------|--------------------|---------------|---|------------------------|
|          |  |          |       | UNIT PRICE      | TOTAL AMOUNT  | UNIT PRICE       | TOTAL AMOUNT  | UNIT PRICE                   | TOTAL AMOUNT  | UNIT PRICE          | TOTAL AMOUNT  | UNIT PRICE         | TOTAL AMOUNT  |   |                        |
|          |  |          |       |                 |               |                  |               |                              |               |                     |               |                    |               |   |                        |
| 201.10   | Clearing and Grubbing Including Individual Trees & Stumps          | 1        | L.S.  | \$ 85,000.00    | \$ 85,000.00  | \$ 10,000.00     | \$ 10,000.00  | \$ 202,000.00                | \$ 202,000.00 | \$ 60,000.00        | \$ 60,000.00  | \$ 100,000.00      | \$ 100,000.00 | \$ (15,000.00)                          | N                      |
| 203.15   | Common Excavation  | 18,000   | C.Y.  | \$ 18.75        | \$ 337,500.00 | \$ 10.00         | \$ 180,000.00 | \$ 10.00                     | \$ 180,000.00 | \$ 16.00            | \$ 288,000.00 | \$ 10.57           | \$ 190,260.00 | \$ 147,240.00                           | Y                      |
| 203.16   | Solid Rock Excavation  | 1800     | C.Y.  | \$ 75.00        | \$ 135,000.00 | \$ 50.00         | \$ 90,000.00  | \$ 89.00                     | \$ 160,200.00 | \$ 35.00            | \$ 63,000.00  | \$ 51.78           | \$ 93,204.00  | \$ 41,796.00                            | N                      |
| 203.30   | Earth Borrow   | 3550     | C.Y.  | \$ 11.00        | \$ 39,050.00  | \$ 17.75         | \$ 63,012.50  | \$ 11.45                     | \$ 40,647.50  | \$ 13.00            | \$ 46,150.00  | \$ 10.00           | \$ 35,500.00  | \$ 3,550.00                             | N                      |
| 204.20   | Trench Excavation of Earth   | 4850     | C.Y.  | \$ 28.00        | \$ 135,800.00 | \$ 15.00         | \$ 72,750.00  | \$ 9.50                      | \$ 46,075.00  | \$ 24.00            | \$ 116,400.00 | \$ 7.47            | \$ 36,229.50  | \$ 99,570.50                            | Y                      |
| 204.25   | Structure Excavation   | 280      | C.Y.  | \$ 28.00        | \$ 7,840.00   | \$ 20.00         | \$ 5,600.00   | \$ 17.00                     | \$ 4,760.00   | \$ 18.00            | \$ 5,040.00   | \$ 20.60           | \$ 5,768.00   | \$ 2,072.00                             | N                      |
| 204.30   | Granular Backfill for Structures                                   | 1500     | C.Y.  | \$ 35.00        | \$ 52,500.00  | \$ 34.00         | \$ 51,000.00  | \$ 51.00                     | \$ 76,500.00  | \$ 50.00            | \$ 75,000.00  | \$ 43.57           | \$ 65,355.00  | \$ (12,855.00)                          | N                      |
| 210.10   | Cold Planing, Bituminous Pavement                                  | 7200     | S.Y.  | \$ 2.75         | \$ 19,800.00  | \$ 1.25          | \$ 9,000.00   | \$ 3.00                      | \$ 21,600.00  | \$ 2.00             | \$ 14,400.00  | \$ 5.11            | \$ 36,792.00  | \$ (16,992.00)                          | N                      |
| 301.26   | Subbase of Crushed Gravel, Fine Graded                             | 4000     | C.Y.  | \$ 55.00        | \$ 220,000.00 | \$ 32.88         | \$ 131,520.00 | \$ 37.00                     | \$ 148,000.00 | \$ 50.00            | \$ 200,000.00 | \$ 25.00           | \$ 100,000.00 | \$ 120,000.00                           | Y                      |
| 301.35   | Subbase of Dense Graded Crushed Stone                              | 750      | C.Y.  | \$ 38.00        | \$ 28,500.00  | \$ 32.88         | \$ 24,660.00  | \$ 35.00                     | \$ 26,250.00  | \$ 50.00            | \$ 37,500.00  | \$ 40.09           | \$ 30,067.50  | \$ (1,567.50)                           | N                      |
| 310.20   | Reclaimed Stabilized Base  | 10,000   | C.F.  | \$ 1.75         | \$ 17,500.00  | \$ 1.00          | \$ 10,000.00  | \$ 4.00                      | \$ 40,000.00  | \$ 3.00             | \$ 30,000.00  | \$ 1.75            | \$ 17,500.00  | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 404.65   | Emulsified Asphalt   | 120      | CWT   | \$ 65.00        | \$ 7,800.00   | \$ 45.00         | \$ 5,400.00   | \$ 80.00                     | \$ 9,600.00   | \$ 10.00            | \$ 1,200.00   | \$ 36.92           | \$ 4,430.40   | \$ 3,369.60                             | N                      |
| 406.25   | Bituminous Concrete Pavement                                       | 2750     | TON   | \$ 85.00        | \$ 233,750.00 | \$ 86.00         | \$ 236,500.00 | \$ 107.50                    | \$ 295,625.00 | \$ 83.00            | \$ 228,250.00 | \$ 85.00           | \$ 233,750.00 | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 505.36   | Temporary Steel Sheet Piling                                       | 5000     | S.F.  | \$ 17.00        | \$ 85,000.00  | \$ 10.00         | \$ 50,000.00  | \$ 1.00                      | \$ 5,000.00   | \$ 12.00            | \$ 60,000.00  | \$ 40.00           | \$ 200,000.00 | \$ (115,000.00)                         | Y                      |
| 507.11   | Reinforcing Steel, Level I   | 5600     | LB    | \$ 1.50         | \$ 8,400.00   | \$ 2.00          | \$ 11,200.00  | \$ 1.25                      | \$ 7,000.00   | \$ 1.50             | \$ 8,400.00   | \$ 2.23            | \$ 12,488.00  | \$ (4,088.00)                           | N                      |
| 514.10   | Water Repellent, Silane  | 25       | GAL   | \$ 40.00        | \$ 1,000.00   | \$ 100.00        | \$ 2,500.00   | \$ 70.00                     | \$ 1,750.00   | \$ 70.00            | \$ 1,750.00   | \$ 100.00          | \$ 2,500.00   | \$ (1,500.00)                           | N                      |
| 540.10   | Precast Concrete Structure (10'-0"x10'-0"x30'-0" Box)              | 1        | L.S.  | \$ 95,875.00    | \$ 95,875.00  | \$ 105,000.00    | \$ 105,000.00 | \$ 98,000.00                 | \$ 98,000.00  | \$ 238,000.00       | \$ 238,000.00 | \$ 90,000.00       | \$ 90,000.00  | \$ 5,875.00                             | N                      |
| 541.25   | Concrete, Class B (12'x6'x20')                                     | 32       | C.Y.  | \$ 800.00       | \$ 25,600.00  | \$ 700.00        | \$ 22,400.00  | \$ 900.00                    | \$ 28,800.00  | \$ 800.00           | \$ 25,600.00  | \$ 761.33          | \$ 24,362.56  | \$ 1,237.44                             | N                      |
| 601.0025 | 24" CSP .064 (2-2/3 X 1/2)   | 170      | L.F.  | \$ 85.00        | \$ 14,450.00  | \$ 90.00         | \$ 15,300.00  | \$ 75.00                     | \$ 12,750.00  | \$ 80.00            | \$ 13,600.00  | \$ 91.01           | \$ 15,471.70  | \$ (1,021.70)                           | N                      |
| 601.0446 | 36" PCCSP .079 (2-2/3 X 1/2)                                       | 60       | L.F.  | \$ 135.00       | \$ 8,100.00   | \$ 120.00        | \$ 7,200.00   | \$ 100.00                    | \$ 6,000.00   | \$ 110.00           | \$ 6,600.00   | \$ 150.00          | \$ 9,000.00   | \$ (900.00)                             | N                      |
| 601.2615 | 18" CPEP (SL)  | 1850     | L.F.  | \$ 55.00        | \$ 101,750.00 | \$ 44.00         | \$ 81,400.00  | \$ 54.00                     | \$ 99,900.00  | \$ 48.00            | \$ 88,800.00  | \$ 25.94           | \$ 47,989.00  | \$ 53,761.00                            | Y                      |
| 601.2620 | 24" CPEP (SL)  | 560      | L.F.  | \$ 85.00        | \$ 47,600.00  | \$ 60.00         | \$ 33,600.00  | \$ 55.00                     | \$ 30,800.00  | \$ 95.00            | \$ 53,200.00  | \$ 80.00           | \$ 44,800.00  | \$ 2,800.00                             | N                      |
| 601.2630 | 36" CPEP (SL)  | 360      | L.F.  | \$ 70.00        | \$ 25,200.00  | \$ 70.00         | \$ 25,200.00  | \$ 72.00                     | \$ 25,920.00  | \$ 110.00           | \$ 39,600.00  | \$ 60.00           | \$ 21,600.00  | \$ 3,600.00                             | N                      |
| 601.7015 | 18" CPEPES   | 8        | EA    | \$ 550.00       | \$ 4,400.00   | \$ 350.00        | \$ 2,800.00   | \$ 360.00                    | \$ 2,880.00   | \$ 300.00           | \$ 2,400.00   | \$ 300.00          | \$ 2,400.00   | \$ 2,000.00                             | N                      |
| 601.7030 | 36" CPEPES   | 3        | EA    | \$ 1,000.00     | \$ 3,000.00   | \$ 1,010.00      | \$ 3,030.00   | \$ 1,025.00                  | \$ 3,075.00   | \$ 750.00           | \$ 2,250.00   | \$ 700.00          | \$ 2,100.00   | \$ 900.00                               | N                      |
| 604.18   | Precast Reinforced Concrete Drop Inlet With Cast Iron Grate        | 9        | EA    | \$ 4,000.00     | \$ 36,000.00  | \$ 3,000.00      | \$ 27,000.00  | \$ 3,800.00                  | \$ 34,200.00  | \$ 3,500.00         | \$ 31,500.00  | \$ 4,706.21        | \$ 42,355.89  | \$ (6,355.89)                           | N                      |
| 604.20   | Precast Reinforced Concrete Catch Basin With Cast Iron Grate       | 18       | EA    | \$ 4,000.00     | \$ 72,000.00  | \$ 3,875.00      | \$ 69,750.00  | \$ 4,600.00                  | \$ 82,800.00  | \$ 3,500.00         | \$ 63,000.00  | \$ 3,008.42        | \$ 54,151.56  | \$ 17,848.44                            | N                      |
| 604.21   | Precast Reinforced Concrete Manhole With Cast Iron Cover           | 3        | EA    | \$ 4,000.00     | \$ 12,000.00  | \$ 3,800.00      | \$ 11,400.00  | \$ 5,980.00                  | \$ 17,940.00  | \$ 4,500.00         | \$ 13,500.00  | \$ 6,000.00        | \$ 18,000.00  | \$ (6,000.00)                           | N                      |
| 604.40   | Changing Elevations of Drop Inlets Catch Basins, & Manholes        | 1        | EA    | \$ 700.00       | \$ 700.00     | \$ 600.00        | \$ 600.00     | \$ 590.00                    | \$ 590.00     | \$ 700.00           | \$ 700.00     | \$ 748.86          | \$ 748.86     | \$ (48.86)                              | N                      |
| 604.42   | Changing Elevations of Manholes                                    | 7        | EA    | \$ 600.00       | \$ 4,200.00   | \$ 600.00        | \$ 4,200.00   | \$ 590.00                    | \$ 4,130.00   | \$ 700.00           | \$ 4,900.00   | \$ 876.91          | \$ 6,138.37   | \$ (1,938.37)                           | N                      |
| 605.10   | 6" Underdrain Pipe   | 1450     | L.F.  | \$ 25.00        | \$ 36,250.00  | \$ 27.00         | \$ 39,150.00  | \$ 18.00                     | \$ 26,100.00  | \$ 22.00            | \$ 31,900.00  | \$ 23.39           | \$ 33,915.50  | \$ 2,334.50                             | N                      |
| 605.11   | 6" Underdrain Carrier Pipe   | 700      | L.F.  | \$ 20.00        | \$ 14,000.00  | \$ 23.00         | \$ 16,100.00  | \$ 27.00                     | \$ 18,900.00  | \$ 15.00            | \$ 10,500.00  | \$ 23.39           | \$ 16,373.00  | \$ (2,373.00)                           | N                      |
| 605.95   | Underdrain Flushing Basin  | 15       | EA    | \$ 650.00       | \$ 9,750.00   | \$ 168.00        | \$ 2,520.00   | \$ 385.00                    | \$ 5,775.00   | \$ 110.00           | \$ 1,650.00   | \$ 325.26          | \$ 4,878.90   | \$ 4,871.10                             | N                      |
| 609.10   | Dust Control With Water  | 700      | MGAL  | \$ 10.00        | \$ 7,000.00   | \$ 20.00         | \$ 14,000.00  | \$ 23.00                     | \$ 16,100.00  | \$ 22.00            | \$ 15,400.00  | \$ 7.14            | \$ 4,998.00   | \$ 2,002.00                             | N                      |
| 613.11   | Stone Fill, Type II  | 4500     | C.Y.  | \$ 55.00        | \$ 247,500.00 | \$ 39.62         | \$ 178,290.00 | \$ 36.00                     | \$ 162,000.00 | \$ 44.00            | \$ 198,000.00 | \$ 45.00           | \$ 202,500.00 | \$ 45,000.00                            | N                      |
| 613.13   | Stone Fill, Type IV  | 250      | C.Y.  | \$ 70.00        | \$ 17,500.00  | \$ 45.00         | \$ 11,250.00  | \$ 45.00                     | \$ 11,250.00  | \$ 60.00            | \$ 15,000.00  | \$ 72.69           | \$ 18,172.50  | \$ (672.50)                             | N                      |
| 616.20   | Granite Slope Edging   | 230      | LF    | \$ 60.00        | \$ 13,800.00  | \$ 41.00         | \$ 9,430.00   | \$ 25.00                     | \$ 5,750.00   | \$ 35.00            | \$ 8,050.00   | \$ 36.12           | \$ 8,307.60   | \$ 5,492.40                             | N                      |
| 616.21   | Vertical Granite Curb  | 2700     | L.F.  | \$ 40.00        | \$ 108,000.00 | \$ 46.00         | \$ 124,200.00 | \$ 31.00                     | \$ 83,700.00  | \$ 41.00            | \$ 110,700.00 | \$ 30.00           | \$ 81,000.00  | \$ 27,000.00                            | N                      |
| 616.41   | Removal of Existing Curb   | 915      | L.F.  | \$ 5.00         | \$ 4,575.00   | \$ 5.00          | \$ 4,575.00   | \$ 11.50                     | \$ 10,522.50  | \$ 20.00            | \$ 18,300.00  | \$ 6.61            | \$ 6,048.15   | \$ (1,473.15)                           | N                      |
| 616.47   | Bituminous Concrete Cutters and Traffic Islands                    | 6        | TON   | \$ 250.00       | \$ 1,500.00   | \$ 300.00        | \$ 1,800.00   | \$ 300.00                    | \$ 1,800.00   | \$ 255.00           | \$ 1,530.00   | \$ 250.00          | \$ 1,500.00   | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 617.10   | Removal of Existing Mailbox, Single Support                        | 8        | EA    | \$ 125.00       | \$ 1,000.00   | \$ 185.00        | \$ 1,480.00   | \$ 225.00                    | \$ 1,800.00   | \$ 200.00           | \$ 1,600.00   | \$ 310.00          | \$ 2,480.00   | \$ (1,480.00)                           | N                      |
| 618.10   | Portland Cement Concrete Sidewalk, 5 Inch                          | 130      | S.Y.  | \$ 80.00        | \$ 10,400.00  | \$ 100.00        | \$ 13,000.00  | \$ 80.00                     | \$ 10,400.00  | \$ 75.00            | \$ 9,750.00   | \$ 132.76          | \$ 17,258.80  | \$ (6,858.80)                           | N                      |
| 618.15   | Bituminous Concrete Sidewalk                                       | 875      | TON   | \$ 125.00       | \$ 109,375.00 | \$ 127.00        | \$ 111,125.00 | \$ 110.50                    | \$ 96,687.50  | \$ 140.00           | \$ 122,500.00 | \$ 100.00          | \$ 87,500.00  | \$ 21,875.00                            | N                      |
| 618.30   | Detectable Warning Surface   | 250      | S.F.  | \$ 35.00        | \$ 8,750.00   | \$ 50.00         | \$ 12,500.00  | \$ 39.00                     | \$ 9,750.00   | \$ 40.00            | \$ 10,000.00  | \$ 42.60           | \$ 10,650.00  | \$ (1,900.00)                           | N                      |
| 619.20   | Removing and Resetting Property Markers                            | 13       | EA    | \$ 350.00       | \$ 4,550.00   | \$ 700.00        | \$ 9,100.00   | \$ 300.00                    | \$ 3,900.00   | \$ 200.00           | \$ 2,600.00   | \$ 284.96          | \$ 3,704.48   | \$ 845.52                               | N                      |
| 620.11   | Chain Link Fence, 4 Feet (Black Vinyl Coated)                      | 2700     | L.F.  | \$ 16.00        | \$ 43,200.00  | \$ 16.25         | \$ 43,875.00  | \$ 19.00                     | \$ 51,300.00  | \$ 16.00            | \$ 43,200.00  | \$ 25.00           | \$ 67,500.00  | \$ (24,300.00)                          | N                      |
| 620.15   | Gate for Chain Link Fence, 4 Feet (Black Vinyl Coated)             | 20       | L.F.  | \$ 45.00        | \$ 900.00     | \$ 42.00         | \$ 840.00     | \$ 49.00                     | \$ 980.00     | \$ 43.00            | \$ 860.00     | \$ 100.00          | \$ 2,000.00   | \$ (1,100.00)                           | N                      |
| 620.20   | Bracing Assembly for Chain Link Fence, 4 Feet (Black Vinyl Coated) | 20       | EA    | \$ 250.00       | \$ 5,000.00   | \$ 227.00        | \$ 4,540.00   | \$ 272.00                    | \$ 5,440.00   | \$ 240.00           | \$ 4,800.00   | \$ 250.00          | \$ 5,000.00   | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 621.80   | Removal and Disposal of Guardrail                                  | 460      | L.F.  | \$ 6.00         | \$ 2,760.00   | \$ 2.00          | \$ 920.00     | \$ 6.75                      | \$ 3,105.00   | \$ 5.50             | \$ 2,530.00   | \$ 2.80            | \$ 1,288.00   | \$ 1,472.00                             | N                      |
| 621.90   | Temporary Traffic Barrier  | 300      | LF    | \$ 50.00        | \$ 15,000.00  | \$ 12.00         | \$ 3,600.00   | \$ 27.00                     | \$ 8,100.00   | \$ 20.00            | \$ 6,000.00   | \$ 16.31           | \$ 4,893.00   | \$ 10,107.00                            | N                      |
| 621.95   | Remove and Reset Temporary Traffic Barrier                         | 600      | L.F.  | \$ 18.00        | \$ 10,800.00  | \$ 12.00         | \$ 7,200.00   | \$ 5.00                      | \$ 3,000.00   | \$ 6.00             | \$ 3,600.00   | \$ 9.00            | \$ 5,400.00   | \$ 5,400.00                             | N                      |
| 629.20   | Adjust Elevation of Valve Box                                      | 10       | EA    | \$ 175.00       | \$ 1,750.00   | \$ 300.00        | \$ 3,000.00   | \$ 138.00                    | \$ 1,380.00   | \$ 110.00           | \$ 1,100.00   | \$ 271.35          | \$ 2,713.50   | \$ (963.50)                             | N                      |
| 630.10   | Uniformed Traffic Officer  | 200      | HR    | \$ 75.00        | \$ 15,000.00  | \$ 46.00         | \$ 9,200.00   | \$ 77.00                     | \$ 15,400.00  | \$ 65.00            | \$ 13,000.00  | \$ 71.66           | \$ 14,332.00  | \$ 668.00                               | N                      |
| 630.15   | Flaggers   | 3000     | HR    | \$ 36.00        | \$ 108,000.00 | \$ 29.50         | \$ 88,500.00  | \$ 34.00                     | \$ 102,000.00 | \$ 28.00            | \$ 84,000.00  | \$ 20.00           | \$ 60,000.00  | \$ 48,000.00                            | Y                      |
| 631.16   | Testing Equipment, Concrete  | 1        | L.S.  | \$ 750.00       | \$ 750.00     | \$ 1,000.00      | \$ 1,000.00   | \$ 250.00                    | \$ 250.00     | \$ 1,000.00         | \$ 1,000.00   | \$ 1,000.00        | \$ 1,000.00   | \$ (250.00)                             | N                      |
| 631.17   | Testing Equipment, Bituminous                                      | 1        | L.S.  | \$ 750.00       | \$ 750.00     | \$ 750.00        | \$ 750.00     | \$ 600.00                    | \$ 600.00     | \$ 1,000.00         | \$ 1,000.00   | \$ 1,000.00        | \$ 1,000.00   | \$ (250.00)                             | N                      |
| 635.11   | Mobilization/Demobilization  | 1        | L.S.  |                 |               |                  |               |                              |               |                     |               |                    |               |   |                        |

| ITEM NO.         | DESCRIPTION   | EST QUAN | UNITS          | J HUTCHINS INC. |                        | BUR CONSTRUCTION |                        | ENGINEERS CONSTRUCTION, INC. |                        | DuBOIS CONSTRUCTION |                        | Engineers Estimate |                        | Difference Between Estimate and Low Bid | Do we need to analyze? |
|------------------|---|----------|----------------|-----------------|------------------------|------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------|---------------------|------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|---|------------------------|
|                  |   |          |                | UNIT PRICE      | TOTAL AMOUNT           | UNIT PRICE       | TOTAL AMOUNT           | UNIT PRICE                   | TOTAL AMOUNT           | UNIT PRICE          | TOTAL AMOUNT           | UNIT PRICE         | TOTAL AMOUNT           |   |                        |
| 646.201          | Durable 4 Inch White Line, Waterborne Paint                               | 3500     | L.F.           | \$ 0.80         | \$ 2,800.00            | \$ 0.85          | \$ 2,975.00            | \$ 0.90                      | \$ 3,150.00            | \$ 0.80             | \$ 2,800.00            | \$ 0.75            | \$ 2,625.00            | \$ 175.00                               | N                      |
| 646.211          | Durable 4 Inch Yellow Line, Waterborne Paint                              | 3500     | L.F.           | \$ 0.80         | \$ 2,800.00            | \$ 0.85          | \$ 2,975.00            | \$ 0.90                      | \$ 3,150.00            | \$ 0.80             | \$ 2,800.00            | \$ 0.75            | \$ 2,625.00            | \$ 175.00                               | N                      |
| 646.241          | 12 Inch White Line, Waterborne Paint                                      | 80       | L.F.           | \$ 4.00         | \$ 320.00              | \$ 13.00         | \$ 1,040.00            | \$ 3.60                      | \$ 288.00              | \$ 4.00             | \$ 320.00              | \$ 0.40            | \$ 32.00               | \$ 288.00                               | N                      |
| 646.261          | 24 Inch Stop Bar, Waterborne Paint  | 70       | L.F.           | \$ 7.00         | \$ 490.00              | \$ 7.00          | \$ 490.00              | \$ 7.25                      | \$ 507.50              | \$ 7.00             | \$ 490.00              | \$ 0.84            | \$ 58.80               | \$ 431.20                               | N                      |
| 646.311          | Crosswalk Marking, Waterborne Paint                                       | 110      | L.F.           | \$ 25.00        | \$ 2,750.00            | \$ 20.00         | \$ 2,200.00            | \$ 24.10                     | \$ 2,651.00            | \$ 21.00            | \$ 2,310.00            | \$ 2.93            | \$ 322.30              | \$ 2,427.70                             | N                      |
| 646.4911         | Durable Letter or Symbol, Type A Tape                                     | 46       | EA             | \$ 230.00       | \$ 10,580.00           | \$ 235.00        | \$ 10,810.00           | \$ 271.00                    | \$ 12,466.00           | \$ 240.00           | \$ 11,040.00           | \$ 60.00           | \$ 2,760.00            | \$ 7,820.00                             | N                      |
| 646.5111         | Durable Railroad Crossing Symbol, Type A Tape                             | 3        | EA             | \$ 1,500.00     | \$ 4,500.00            | \$ 1,300.00      | \$ 3,900.00            | \$ 1,446.00                  | \$ 4,338.00            | \$ 1,300.00         | \$ 3,900.00            | \$ 800.00          | \$ 2,400.00            | \$ 2,100.00                             | N                      |
| 646.602          | Temporary 4 Inch White Line, Paint  | 7000     | L.F.           | \$ 0.75         | \$ 5,250.00            | \$ 0.60          | \$ 4,200.00            | \$ 0.60                      | \$ 4,200.00            | \$ 0.60             | \$ 4,200.00            | \$ 0.23            | \$ 1,610.00            | \$ 3,640.00                             | N                      |
| 646.612          | Temporary 4 Inch Yellow Line, Paint                                       | 7000     | L.F.           | \$ 0.75         | \$ 5,250.00            | \$ 0.60          | \$ 4,200.00            | \$ 0.60                      | \$ 4,200.00            | \$ 0.60             | \$ 4,200.00            | \$ 0.21            | \$ 1,470.00            | \$ 3,780.00                             | N                      |
| 646.682          | Temporary 24 Inch Stop Bar, Paint   | 140      | L.F.           | \$ 6.00         | \$ 840.00              | \$ 6.00          | \$ 840.00              | \$ 6.00                      | \$ 840.00              | \$ 6.00             | \$ 840.00              | \$ 1.00            | \$ 140.00              | \$ 700.00                               | N                      |
| 646.692          | Temporary Letter or Symbol, Paint   | 16       | EA             | \$ 35.00        | \$ 560.00              | \$ 36.00         | \$ 576.00              | \$ 42.25                     | \$ 676.00              | \$ 40.00            | \$ 640.00              | \$ 30.49           | \$ 487.84              | \$ 72.16                                | N                      |
| 649.11           | Geotextile for Roadbed Separator  | 3200     | S.Y.           | \$ 1.30         | \$ 4,160.00            | \$ 1.00          | \$ 3,200.00            | \$ 1.60                      | \$ 5,120.00            | \$ 1.40             | \$ 4,480.00            | \$ 2.27            | \$ 7,264.00            | \$ (3,104.00)                           | N                      |
| 649.51           | Geotextile for Silt Fence   | 430      | S.Y.           | \$ 5.20         | \$ 2,236.00            | \$ 3.00          | \$ 1,290.00            | \$ 4.75                      | \$ 2,042.50            | \$ 4.00             | \$ 1,720.00            | \$ 4.71            | \$ 2,025.30            | \$ 210.70                               | N                      |
| 649.515          | Geotextile for Silt Fence, Woven Wire Reinforced                          | 1000     | S.Y.           | \$ 7.20         | \$ 7,200.00            | \$ 4.00          | \$ 4,000.00            | \$ 7.50                      | \$ 7,500.00            | \$ 5.00             | \$ 5,000.00            | \$ 11.50           | \$ 11,500.00           | \$ (4,300.00)                           | N                      |
| 651.15           | Seed  | 1600     | LB             | \$ 10.00        | \$ 16,000.00           | \$ 8.00          | \$ 12,800.00           | \$ 11.40                     | \$ 18,240.00           | \$ 12.00            | \$ 19,200.00           | \$ 5.74            | \$ 9,184.00            | \$ 6,816.00                             | N                      |
| 651.18           | Fertilizer  | 3550     | LB             | \$ 8.00         | \$ 28,400.00           | \$ 3.00          | \$ 10,650.00           | \$ 3.00                      | \$ 10,650.00           | \$ 2.00             | \$ 7,100.00            | \$ 1.52            | \$ 5,396.00            | \$ 23,004.00                            | N                      |
| 651.20           | Agricultural Limestone  | 15       | TON            | \$ 850.00       | \$ 12,750.00           | \$ 500.00        | \$ 7,500.00            | \$ 507.00                    | \$ 7,605.00            | \$ 500.00           | \$ 7,500.00            | \$ 677.16          | \$ 10,157.40           | \$ 2,592.60                             | N                      |
| 651.25           | Hay Mulch   | 15       | TON            | \$ 850.00       | \$ 12,750.00           | \$ 600.00        | \$ 9,000.00            | \$ 607.00                    | \$ 9,105.00            | \$ 640.00           | \$ 9,600.00            | \$ 528.34          | \$ 7,925.10            | \$ 4,824.90                             | N                      |
| 651.35           | Topsoil   | 1000     | C.Y.           | \$ 60.00        | \$ 60,000.00           | \$ 30.00         | \$ 30,000.00           | \$ 30.00                     | \$ 30,000.00           | \$ 50.00            | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ 40.34           | \$ 40,340.00           | \$ 19,660.00                            | N                      |
| 651.40           | Grubbing Material (6")  | 6000     | S.Y.           | \$ 1.25         | \$ 7,500.00            | \$ 17.50         | \$ 105,000.00          | \$ 3.35                      | \$ 20,100.00           | \$ 6.00             | \$ 36,000.00           | \$ 4.67            | \$ 28,020.00           | \$ (20,520.00)                          | N                      |
| 651.40           | Grubbing Material (12")   | 1700     | S.Y.           | \$ 2.50         | \$ 4,250.00            | \$ 25.00         | \$ 42,500.00           | \$ 4.35                      | \$ 7,395.00            | \$ 12.00            | \$ 20,400.00           | \$ 4.67            | \$ 7,939.00            | \$ (3,689.00)                           | N                      |
| 652.10           | EPSC Plan   | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 5,250.00     | \$ 5,250.00            | \$ 4,200.00      | \$ 4,200.00            | \$ 3,000.00                  | \$ 3,000.00            | \$ 2,500.00         | \$ 2,500.00            | \$ 10,000.00       | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ (4,750.00)                           | N                      |
| 652.20           | Monitoring EPSC Plan  | 200      | HR             | \$ 75.00        | \$ 15,000.00           | \$ 10.00         | \$ 2,000.00            | \$ 60.00                     | \$ 12,000.00           | \$ 100.00           | \$ 20,000.00           | \$ 24.24           | \$ 4,848.00            | \$ 10,152.00                            | N                      |
| 652.30           | Maintenance of EPSC Plan (N.A.B.I.)                                       | 1        | L.U.           | \$ 25,000.00    | \$ 25,000.00           | \$ 25,000.00     | \$ 25,000.00           | \$ 25,000.00                 | \$ 25,000.00           | \$ 25,000.00        | \$ 25,000.00           | \$ 25,000.00       | \$ 25,000.00           | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 653.20           | Temporary Erosion Matting   | 10,000   | S.Y.           | \$ 1.40         | \$ 14,000.00           | \$ 3.00          | \$ 30,000.00           | \$ 2.00                      | \$ 20,000.00           | \$ 4.50             | \$ 45,000.00           | \$ 1.47            | \$ 14,700.00           | \$ (700.00)                             | N                      |
| 653.25           | Temporary Stone Check Dam, Type I   | 50       | C.Y.           | \$ 125.00       | \$ 6,250.00            | \$ 150.00        | \$ 7,500.00            | \$ 49.00                     | \$ 2,450.00            | \$ 50.00            | \$ 2,500.00            | \$ 47.42           | \$ 2,371.00            | \$ 3,879.00                             | N                      |
| 653.40           | Inlet Protection Device, Type I   | 65       | EA             | \$ 200.00       | \$ 13,000.00           | \$ 195.00        | \$ 12,675.00           | \$ 150.00                    | \$ 9,750.00            | \$ 265.00           | \$ 17,225.00           | \$ 172.00          | \$ 11,180.00           | \$ 1,820.00                             | N                      |
| 653.45           | Filter Bag  | 1        | EA             | \$ 750.00       | \$ 750.00              | \$ 325.00        | \$ 325.00              | \$ 340.00                    | \$ 340.00              | \$ 100.00           | \$ 100.00              | \$ 390.30          | \$ 390.30              | \$ 359.70                               | N                      |
| 653.50           | Barrier Fence   | 210      | L.F.           | \$ 2.75         | \$ 577.50              | \$ 2.00          | \$ 420.00              | \$ 2.10                      | \$ 441.00              | \$ 1.00             | \$ 210.00              | \$ 1.95            | \$ 409.50              | \$ 168.00                               | N                      |
| 653.55           | Project Demarcation Fence   | 14500    | L.F.           | \$ 0.75         | \$ 10,875.00           | \$ 0.85          | \$ 12,325.00           | \$ 1.00                      | \$ 14,500.00           | \$ 1.00             | \$ 14,500.00           | \$ 0.67            | \$ 9,715.00            | \$ 1,160.00                             | N                      |
| 656.25           | Evergreen Shrubs (Buxus X Green Mountain)                                 | 40       | EA             | \$ 65.00        | \$ 2,600.00            | \$ 200.00        | \$ 8,000.00            | \$ 55.00                     | \$ 2,200.00            | \$ 50.00            | \$ 2,000.00            | \$ 50.00           | \$ 2,000.00            | \$ 600.00                               | N                      |
| 656.65           | Landscape Watering  | 10       | MGAL           | \$ 160.00       | \$ 1,600.00            | \$ 25.00         | \$ 250.00              | \$ 425.00                    | \$ 4,250.00            | \$ 350.00           | \$ 3,500.00            | \$ 27.68           | \$ 276.80              | \$ 1,323.20                             | N                      |
| 656.85           | Tree Protection   | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 1,500.00     | \$ 1,500.00            | \$ 3,000.00      | \$ 3,000.00            | \$ 3,350.00                  | \$ 3,350.00            | \$ 3,000.00         | \$ 3,000.00            | \$ 5,000.00        | \$ 5,000.00            | \$ (3,500.00)                           | N                      |
| 675.20           | Traffic Signs, Type A   | 380      | S.F.           | \$ 15.00        | \$ 5,700.00            | \$ 2.00          | \$ 760.00              | \$ 17.00                     | \$ 6,460.00            | \$ 15.00            | \$ 5,700.00            | \$ 15.72           | \$ 5,973.60            | \$ (273.60)                             | N                      |
| 675.341          | Square Tube Sign Post and Anchor  | 1060     | L.F.           | \$ 12.00        | \$ 12,720.00           | \$ 1.00          | \$ 1,060.00            | \$ 13.00                     | \$ 13,780.00           | \$ 12.00            | \$ 12,720.00           | \$ 10.75           | \$ 11,395.00           | \$ 1,325.00                             | N                      |
| 675.50           | Removing Signs  | 41       | EA             | \$ 10.00        | \$ 410.00              | \$ 13.00         | \$ 533.00              | \$ 11.00                     | \$ 451.00              | \$ 10.00            | \$ 410.00              | \$ 14.46           | \$ 592.86              | \$ (182.86)                             | N                      |
| 675.60           | Erecting Salvaged Signs   | 8        | EA             | \$ 25.00        | \$ 200.00              | \$ 50.00         | \$ 400.00              | \$ 24.00                     | \$ 192.00              | \$ 22.00            | \$ 176.00              | \$ 31.48           | \$ 251.84              | \$ (51.84)                              | N                      |
| 900.608          | Special Provision (Cedar Mulch)   | 20       | C.Y.           | \$ 30.00        | \$ 600.00              | \$ 70.00         | \$ 1,400.00            | \$ 75.00                     | \$ 1,500.00            | \$ 65.00            | \$ 1,300.00            | \$ 50.00           | \$ 1,000.00            | \$ (400.00)                             | N                      |
| 900.608          | Special Provision (Aggregate Surface Course, Sidewalk/Trail)              | 600      | C.Y.           | \$ 60.00        | \$ 36,000.00           | \$ 46.00         | \$ 27,600.00           | \$ 45.50                     | \$ 27,300.00           | \$ 65.00            | \$ 39,000.00           | \$ 60.00           | \$ 36,000.00           | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 900.608          | Special Provision (Excavation of Petroleum Contaminated Soils, Class I)   | 10       | C.Y.           | \$ 300.00       | \$ 3,000.00            | \$ 55.00         | \$ 550.00              | \$ 275.00                    | \$ 2,750.00            | \$ 55.00            | \$ 550.00              | \$ 175.00          | \$ 1,750.00            | \$ 1,250.00                             | N                      |
| 900.608          | Special Provision (Excavation of Petroleum Contaminated Soils, Class II)  | 10       | C.Y.           | \$ 300.00       | \$ 3,000.00            | \$ 55.00         | \$ 550.00              | \$ 275.00                    | \$ 2,750.00            | \$ 85.00            | \$ 850.00              | \$ 500.00          | \$ 5,000.00            | \$ (2,000.00)                           | N                      |
| 900.608          | Special Provision (Excavation of Petroleum Contaminated Soils, Class III) | 10       | C.Y.           | \$ 300.00       | \$ 3,000.00            | \$ 55.00         | \$ 550.00              | \$ 325.00                    | \$ 3,250.00            | \$ 110.00           | \$ 1,100.00            | \$ 1,000.00        | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ (7,000.00)                           | N                      |
| 900.608          | Special Provision (Stone Fill, Streambed Material)(Type III)              | 325      | C.Y.           | \$ 75.00        | \$ 24,375.00           | \$ 10.00         | \$ 3,250.00            | \$ 50.00                     | \$ 16,250.00           | \$ 55.00            | \$ 17,875.00           | \$ 85.00           | \$ 27,625.00           | \$ (3,250.00)                           | N                      |
| 900.615          | Special Provision (Maintenance of Railroad Traffic)(N.A.B.I.)             | 50000    | D.L.           | \$ 1.00         | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ 1.00          | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ 1.00                      | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ 1.00             | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ 1.00            | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 900.620          | Special Provision (Beehive Grate Catch Basin)                             | 4        | EA             | \$ 4,000.00     | \$ 16,000.00           | \$ 6,500.00      | \$ 26,000.00           | \$ 5,375.00                  | \$ 21,500.00           | \$ 1,000.00         | \$ 4,000.00            | \$ 3,500.00        | \$ 14,000.00           | \$ 2,000.00                             | N                      |
| 900.620          | Special Provision (CPM Schedule)  | 5        | EA             | \$ 950.00       | \$ 4,750.00            | \$ 500.00        | \$ 2,500.00            | \$ 350.00                    | \$ 1,750.00            | \$ 1,000.00         | \$ 5,000.00            | \$ 3,000.00        | \$ 15,000.00           | \$ (10,250.00)                          | N                      |
| 900.640          | Special Provision (Rubber Rail Seal)                                      | 50       | LF             | \$ 845.00       | \$ 42,250.00           | \$ 400.00        | \$ 20,000.00           | \$ 842.00                    | \$ 42,100.00           | \$ 360.00           | \$ 18,000.00           | \$ 400.00          | \$ 20,000.00           | \$ 22,250.00                            | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Bioretention Pond 1)                                   | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 30,000.00    | \$ 30,000.00           | \$ 30,000.00     | \$ 30,000.00           | \$ 12,650.00                 | \$ 12,650.00           | \$ 65,000.00        | \$ 65,000.00           | \$ 25,000.00       | \$ 25,000.00           | \$ 5,000.00                             | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Bioretention Pond 2)                                   | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 30,000.00    | \$ 30,000.00           | \$ 33,000.00     | \$ 33,000.00           | \$ 18,800.00                 | \$ 18,800.00           | \$ 65,000.00        | \$ 65,000.00           | \$ 50,000.00       | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ (20,000.00)                          | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Honeysuckle Control)                                   | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 6,000.00     | \$ 6,000.00            | \$ 5,000.00      | \$ 5,000.00            | \$ 8,000.00                  | \$ 8,000.00            | \$ 10,000.00        | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ 15,000.00       | \$ 15,000.00           | \$ (9,000.00)                           | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Japanese Knotweed Control)                             | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 2,500.00     | \$ 2,500.00            | \$ 10,000.00     | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ 9,000.00                  | \$ 9,000.00            | \$ 10,000.00        | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ 15,000.00       | \$ 15,000.00           | \$ (12,500.00)                          | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Plantings)   | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 15,000.00    | \$ 15,000.00           | \$ 70,000.00     | \$ 70,000.00           | \$ 38,000.00                 | \$ 38,000.00           | \$ 31,000.00        | \$ 31,000.00           | \$ 50,000.00       | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ (35,000.00)                          | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Rail Yard Relocation)                                  | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 235,000.00   | \$ 235,000.00          | \$ 180,000.00    | \$ 180,000.00          | \$ 233,410.00                | \$ 233,410.00          | \$ 165,000.00       | \$ 165,000.00          | \$ 300,000.00      | \$ 300,000.00          | \$ (65,000.00)                          | Y                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Sanitary Sewer System)                                 | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 45,000.00    | \$ 45,000.00           | \$ 40,000.00     | \$ 40,000.00           | \$ 38,350.00                 | \$ 38,350.00           | \$ 50,000.00        | \$ 50,000.00           | \$ 75,000.00       | \$ 75,000.00           | \$ (30,000.00)                          | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Temporary Relocation of Stream)                        | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 10,000.00    | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ 10,000.00     | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ 8,500.00                  | \$ 8,500.00            | \$ 7,500.00         | \$ 7,500.00            | \$ 10,000.00       | \$ 10,000.00           | \$ -                                    | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Trench Drain)  | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 4,500.00     | \$ 4,500.00            | \$ 7,500.00      | \$ 7,500.00            | \$ 2,500.00                  | \$ 2,500.00            | \$ 5,000.00         | \$ 5,000.00            | \$ 2,500.00        | \$ 2,500.00            | \$ 2,000.00                             | N                      |
| 900.645          | Special Provision (Water Line Relocation)                                 | 1        | L.S.           | \$ 87,500.00    | \$ 87,500.00           | \$ 70,500.00     | \$ 70,500.00           | \$ 94,000.00                 | \$ 94,000.00           | \$ 120,000.00       | \$ 120,000.00          | \$ 75,000.00       | \$ 75,000.00           | \$ 12,500.00                            | N                      |
| 900.670          | Special Provision (Unit Block Retaining Wall)                             | 5500     | S.F.           | \$ 46.00        | \$ 253,000.00          | \$ 60.00         | \$ 330,000.00          | \$ 78.55                     | \$ 432,025.00          | \$ 75.00            | \$ 412,500.00          | \$ 100.00          | \$ 550,000.00          | \$ (297,000.00)                         | Y                      |
| 900.670          | Special Provision (Unit Block Retaining Wall with Fence)                  | 9900     | S.F.           | \$ 48.00        | \$ 475,200.00          | \$ 60.00         | \$ 594,000.00          | \$ 65.45                     | \$ 647,955.00          | \$ 77.00            | \$ 762,300.00          | \$ 110.00          | \$ 1,089,000.00        | \$ (613,800.00)                         | Y                      |
| <b>TOTAL BID</b> |   |          |                |                 | <b>\$ 4,696,668.50</b> |                  | <b>\$ 4,794,961.50</b> |                              | <b>\$ 4,817,510.50</b> |                     | <b>\$ 5,097,366.00</b> |                    | <b>\$ 5,444,937.55</b> |   |                        |
|                  |   |          | % of Eng. Est. | 86.3%           | % of Eng. Est.         | 88.1%            | % of Eng. Est.         | 88.5%                        | % of Eng. Est.         | 93.6%               | % of Eng. Est.         | 100.0%             |                        |   |                        |
|                  |   |          | % Different EE | 13.7%           | % Different EE         | 11.9%            | % Different EE         | 11.5%                        | % Different EE         | 6.4%                | % Different EE         | 0.0%               |                        |   |                        |

No Discrepancies noted by Engineer

John D. Merrifield



621994  
July 6, 2018

Mr. Corey Line  
Project Manager  
39 Main St  
Montpelier, VT 05602

**SUBJECT: Montpelier-Berlin Shared Use Path STP BIKE(33)S  
Bid Analysis and Recommendation of Award for Construction**

Dear Mr. Line:

Four (4) bids were received on June 29, 2018, for the Montpelier-Berlin Shared Use Path Project. The Engineer's Estimate for construction was \$5,443,937.55. All four bids were less than the Engineer's Estimate. The bids ranged from \$4,696,688.50 to \$5,097,366.00. Based upon the chart found in Section 5.a of FHWA's Guidelines on Preparing Engineer's Estimate, Bid Reviews and Evaluation dated January 20, 2004 it was determined that the bids received for this project were competitive.

Bids submitted for this contract have been reviewed for reasonable conformance with the engineer's estimated prices, resulting in the following recommendation:

J. Hutchins Inc.'s bid of \$4,696,688.50 should be accepted. Analysis has failed to indicate an advantage to the contractor with corresponding disadvantage to the City.

The bid should be rejected for the following reason(s):

APPROVED: Ande Deforge for JMP Date: 7/10/2018  
Ande Deforge, P.E.  
VTrans Project Manager *Supervisor*

APPROVED: Corey Line Date: 7-10-2018  
Corey Line  
Project Manager

The low bidder for the project is J. Hutchins Inc. Their bid \$4,696,688.50 is 12.7% less than the Engineer's Estimate. They fulfilled the bidding requirements including submission of the 5% bid security in the form of a bid bond, fully completed the Bid Proposal Form, and submitted executed EEO and Non-Collusion Affidavits.

We understand J. Hutchins Inc. has worked for the City of Montpelier in the past and that the City is happy with their work.

A threshold of 1% of the low bid was used to determine which pay items required analysis. This value is \$46,966.69. Eleven (11) pay items were found to require analysis because the extended low bid estimate deviated from the extended Engineer's Estimate by an amount greater than this 1% threshold. Please refer to the attached Bid Tab for bid prices. An assessment of each of the items requiring analysis is offered on the following pages:

**Item Number: 203.15**

**Item Description: Common Excavation**

**Estimated Quantity: 18000 CY**

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$10.57           | \$190,260.00    | \$18.75           | \$337,500.00   | + \$147,240.00    |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is higher than the Engineer's Estimate and other bidder's unit price for this construction item. The contract quantity has been verified. This project involves a fair amount of excavation that is distributed along a narrow worksite. It will be necessary to move material about the site in order to minimize the use of earth borrow. This will be particularly labor intensive in the area between Old Country Club Road and Route 2. In that area the existing slopes are very steep. Production rates will be limited by the narrow access to the work areas which may require trucks to back in or out one at a time.

These factors all may contribute to the high unit price for this item. However, the calculations used to prepare the Engineer's Estimate were conservative, the plan quantity has been confirmed and it is unlikely that the pay quantity will exceed the plan quantity. It is recommended that the low bid price for this item be accepted.

**Item Number: 204.20**

**Item Description: Trench Excavation of Earth**

**Estimated Quantity: 4850 CY**

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$7.47            | \$36,229.50     | \$28.00           | \$135,800.00   | + \$99,570.00     |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is higher than the Engineer’s Estimate and other bidder’s unit price for this construction item. The Engineer’s Estimate price was obtained from the Estimator program and appears to have been influenced by some projects that included large quantities of pipe and trench excavation. This hypothesis is supported by Engineers Constuction’s bid of \$9.50 per CY which is fairly close to the Engineer’s Estimate.

The contract quantity has been and found to be accurate.

This item will require careful tracking on the part of the resident engineer. We will provide a copy of our calculations to them in order to assist them in this. It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.

**Item Number: 301.26**

**Item Description: Subbase of Crushed Gravel, Fine Graded**

**Estimated Quantity: 4000 CY**

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$25.00           | \$100,000.00    | \$55.00           | \$220,000.00   | + \$120,000.00    |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is higher than the Engineer’s Estimate unit price for this construction item and is higher than the competing bids.

The plan quantity has been verified and the plans clearly define where this pay item should be used.

The contractor was contacted regarding the price of this bid item. They explained that the high cost was due to the expected rate of production. The path is narrow and access is expected to be limited to one truck at a time in some areas.

Although the unit price for this item is high the quantity itself is clearly defined and overruns are unlikely. It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.





**Item Number:** 505.36

**Item Description:** Temporary Steel Sheet Piling

**Estimated Quantity:** 5000 SF

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$40.00           | \$200,000.00    | \$17.00           | \$85,000.00    | - \$115,000.00    |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is lower than the Engineer’s Estimate unit price for this construction item and higher than the competing bids. This pay item has only been used twice in the last 5 years according to the most recent 5 Year Averaged Price List. On the July 2012-June 2017 5 Year Averaged Price List the unit price is \$15.95 and on the July 2015-June 2017 2 Year Averaged Price List the unit price is \$166.00. In general this pay item is not used often in Vermont and the Engineer’s Estimate unit price was based upon available information. This pay item is not required by the final design but has been included in case the contractor determines that its use would make the slope excavation faster or easier. It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.

**Item Number:** 601.2615

**Item Description:** 18” CPEP(SL)

**Estimated Quantity:** 1850 LF

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$25.940          | \$47,989.00     | \$55.00           | \$101,750.00   | + \$53,761.00     |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is significantly higher than the Engineer’s Estimate unit price for this construction item and slightly higher than the other bids and the prices from the most recent 2 and 5 year Averaged Price Lists. The price for the Engineer’s Estimate was obtained from the Estimator program and appears to have been influenced by some projects that included large quantities of pipe and trench excavation.

The contract quantity has been verified and was calculated conservatively. This item will be fairly easy to track due to the linear nature of the item and overruns are not anticipated.

It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.



**Item Number: 630.15**

**Item Description: Flaggers**

**Estimated Quantity: 3000 HR**

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$20.00           | \$60,000.00     | \$36.00           | \$108,000.00   | + \$48,000.00     |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is higher than the Engineer’s Estimate and other bidder’s unit price for this construction item. The Engineer’s Estimate unit price is about 20% lower than the unit price shown in the most recent 2 and 5 year Averaged Price Lists and was chosen based upon the size and duration of this project. Flagging prices in Vermont have recently gone up significantly primarily due to ADA Traffic Control’s decision to start flaggers at \$16 per hour in response to their violation of Burlington’s Livable Wage Ordinance. This is a significant change in wages for the flaggers and is reflected in the overall price for flagging services.

The quantity for this item can vary a great deal depending upon the schedule set by the contractor. The resident engineer should monitor the hours of flagging used on the project and bring the issue to the attention of the contractor if it appears that flaggers are being used inefficiently.

It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.

**Item Number: 635.11**

**Item Description: Mobilization/Demobilization**

**Estimated Quantity: 1 LS**

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$402,301.14      | \$402,301.14    | \$265,000.00      | \$265,000.00   | + \$137,301.14    |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is lower than the Engineer’s Estimate and the other bidder’s unit price for this construction item. The Engineer’s Estimate price was determined following the guidance in provided by VTrans in estimating Mobilization/Demobilization as a portion of the total estimate excluding traffic control. A value of 8 percent was used. The low bid used a value of 6%, and the remaining bidders used values of 7%, 8% and 17%. The low bid unit price is based upon an acceptable methodology and the 6% multiplier is reasonable. The contractor is based in Richmond and only one of the other bidders closer. Some of the bidders are significantly farther from the project site.

It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.



**Item Number:** 641.10

**Item Description:** Traffic Control

**Estimated Quantity:** 1 LS

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$150,000.00      | \$150,000.00    | \$85,000.00       | \$85,000.00    | - \$65,000.00     |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is lower than the Engineer’s Estimate and higher than the competing bids. The Engineer’s Estimate price was estimated as a portion of the total contract cost excluding mobilization, and then rounded to an even dollar amount. 2.75 % was used to calculate the Engineer’s Estimate unit price. The low bidder used a value of 1.8% while the remaining bidders ranged from approximately 0.4% to 1.4%.

This project parallels the existing roadways for most of its length, but is generally offset from the travelled way such that lane closures are not expected beyond what is needed for installing the various pipe systems and reclaim work. No detours are anticipated, and flaggers, uniformed traffic officers and temporary traffic barriers are all paid for under separate items.

It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.

**Item Number:** 900.645

**Item Description:** Special Provision (Rail Yard Relocation)

**Estimated Quantity:** 1 EA

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$300,000.00      | \$300,000.00    | \$235,000.00      | \$235,000.00   | - \$65,000.00     |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is lower than the Engineer’s Estimate and higher than the other bidder’s unit price for this construction item. It is very close to the bid submitted by Engineers Construction Inc., who is the bidder with the most railroad experience. This item represents a fairly unique pay item for a VTrans project and was written with the presumption that qualified contractors would inspect the project site and use their experience to determine to appropriate level of effort for the task. In consulting with the railroad during the design process a value of \$250,000 had been carried throughout the development of the plans as the estimated cost to relocate the tracks within the railyard. This value was increased to the \$300,000 found in the Engineer’s Estimate in order to account for the amount of time that passed between the initial coordination and the final advertisement of the project. This work is required to satisfy the requirements of the railroad and the low bid unit price



appears to be high enough that this will be reasonably accomplished. It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.

**Item Number: 900.670**

**Item Description: Special Provision (Unit Block Retaining Wall)**

**Estimated Quantity: 5500 SF**

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$100.00          | \$550,000.00    | \$46.00           | \$253,000.00   | - \$297,000.00    |

**Description:** The low bid unit price is much lower than the Engineer’s Estimate and the other bidder’s unit price for this construction item. The bid is higher than the unit block costs based upon previous discussions with the manufacturer’s representative (\$20-\$30 per SF depending on size/shape), but is lower than what has been seen on other projects in the Barre/Montpelier area.

This project does include a large amount of wall, which could help to bring down the unit costs both from bulk pricing from the manufacturer and also efficiencies realized by constructing large amounts of the same item in a relatively small geographical area. Additionally, most of these walls involve either short existing slopes or are being built to retain a newly constructed slope which will reduce the amount of effort required to stabilize the uphill ground. The large amount of blocks required could also allow for a more flexible delivery schedule that could reduce prices by optimizing the manufacturer’s workflow.

The Contractor was contacted to discuss the price of this item. They acknowledged that they had received a very good price on the walls and pointed out that the slowest portion of the wall work is the setting of the base blocks. Most of the walls are 3 or more blocks high so production rates will be more efficient than on shorter walls.

The contract quantity has been checked and confirmed.

It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.

**Item Number: 900.670**

**Item Description: Special Provision (Unit Block Retaining Wall With Fence)**

**Estimated Quantity: 9900 SF**

| Estimate          | Extended        | Low Bid           | Extended       | Low Bid           |
|-------------------|-----------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Estimate</u> | <u>Unit Price</u> | <u>Low Bid</u> | <u>Difference</u> |
| \$110.00          | \$1,089,000.00  | \$48.00           | \$475,200.00   | - \$613,800.00    |



**Description:** The low bid unit price is much lower than the Engineer's Estimate and the other bidder's unit price for this construction item. The bid is higher than the unit block costs based upon previous discussions with the manufacturer's representative (\$20-\$30 per SF depending on size/shape), but is lower than what has been seen on other projects in the Barre/Montpelier area.

This project does include a large amount of wall, which could help to bring down the unit costs both from bulk pricing from the manufacturer and also efficiencies realized by constructing large amounts of the same item in a relatively small geographical area. Additionally, most of these walls involve either short existing slopes or are being built to retain a newly constructed slope which will reduce the amount of effort required to stabilize the uphill ground. The large amount of blocks required could also allow for a more flexible delivery schedule that could reduce prices by optimizing the manufacturer's workflow.

The Contractor was contacted to discuss the price of this item. They acknowledged that they had received a very good price on the walls and pointed out that the slowest portion of the wall work is the setting of the base blocks. Most of the walls are 3 or more blocks high so production rates will be more efficient than on shorter walls.

The contract quantity has been checked and confirmed.

It is recommended that the low bid unit price be approved.

Based on review of the bid, it is our opinion that J. Hutchins, Inc. is the lowest responsive and responsible bidder. Several unit prices in this bid vary significantly from the Engineer's Estimate and justification for this is presented above. It is emphasized that during the construction phase, careful daily tracking of unit quantities will be critical to make sure that the project is constructed within the allowable budget.

We recommend that the City of Montpelier award the construction contract in the amount of \$4,696,688.50 to:

J. Hutchins, Inc.

With this letter, I have enclosed a copy of our Bid Tabulation.

Very truly yours,

DuBOIS & KING, INC.



John Merrifield  
Project Manager



CITY COUNCIL Agenda Item #18-210

Date: July 11, 2018

Consent  Discussion  Time Sensitive

**SUBJECT:** Set the Municipal Tax Rates for FY19

**SUBMITTING DEPARTMENT:** Finance Department

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** Approve setting the fiscal year 2019 Municipal Tax Rate of \$1.0852 and setting the Water/Sewer Benefit Charge of \$.02 and the Sewer Separation Charge of \$.07

**RELATED COUNCIL GOAL/PRIOR ACTION:** Voter Approved Spending for FY19 is \$9,418,819

**LEGAL REQUIREMENTS:** Council sets tax rate based on voter approved budget.

**BACKGROUND INFORMATION:**

Municipal Rate: Overall, the Grand List is up .17% which is less than the 0.5% projected increase. This causes the recommended tax rate to be \$1.0852 (up 2.7 cents, 2.35%). This rate is nominally more than the \$1.0806 rate that was projected in the FY19 Budget documents. For the Downtown Improvement District, voters continued to approve an additional tax rate of \$0.515 (sixth year of this tax). Water, sewer and CSO benefit charges total 9 cents – unchanged from the previous years.

Education rates: The State of Vermont sets the education tax rates. The Homestead Rate is 1.6012 which is down .02 cents (-1.37%). The Non-Residential Rate is \$1.7116 which is up 8.21 cents (5.04%).

Total Tax Rates: Homestead Tax Rate: \$2.7764 up .48 cents (.19%)  
Non-Residential Tax Rate: \$2.8868 up 10.95 cents (3.93%)

**Time Sensitive:** Tax bills must be mailed out 30 days prior to the first installment due date of August 15<sup>th</sup>.

**SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS:** Recommended Tax Rate FY19 worksheet with comparisons to previous year.

**INTERESTED PARTIES:** City Council, Voters, Property Owners

**CITY MANAGER'S APPROVAL:**

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "W. Hoffman".

**Proposed Tax Rate FY19**

**Consideration of Setting the Fiscal Year 2019 Municipal Tax Rate of \$1.0852**

**Consideration of Setting the Water and Sewer Benefit Charge of \$.02 and the Sewer Separation Charge of \$.07 (same as previous year)**

**The Fiscal Year 2019 Downtown Improvement District Tax Rate of \$0.0515 was approved through Article 14 at the City Meeting vote March 6, 2018.**

|                              |  |           |                  |                                     |
|------------------------------|--|-----------|------------------|-------------------------------------|
| <b>Municipal Grand List:</b> | Real Estate                              | \$        | 8,333,802        |                                     |
|                              | Personal Property                        | \$        | 395,473          |                                     |
|                              | Exemptions                               | \$        | (50,028)         |                                     |
|                              | <b>TOTAL</b>                             | <b>\$</b> | <b>8,679,247</b> | Budgeted Grand List<br>\$ 8,707,900 |
|                              | <b>Voter Approved Municipal Spending</b> | <b>\$</b> | <b>9,418,819</b> |                                     |
|                              | <b><u>Education TAX RATES</u></b>        |           |                  |                                     |
|                              | Residential                              | \$        | 1.6012           |                                     |
|                              | Non-Residential                          | \$        | 1.7116           |                                     |

| <b>RESIDENTIAL</b>                        | <b>FY18<br/>RATE</b> | <b>FY19<br/>RATE</b> | <b>NON-RESIDENTIAL</b>                    | <b>FY18<br/>RATE</b> | <b>FY19<br/>RATE</b> |
|---|----------------------|----------------------|---|----------------------|----------------------|
| City, Cemetery, Agencies, Senior Ctr, Rec | \$1.0488             | \$1.0757             | City, Cemetery, Agencies, Senior Ctr, Rec | \$1.0488             | \$1.0757             |
| Washington County Tax                     | \$0.0083             | \$0.0085             | Washington County Tax                     | \$0.0083             | \$0.0085             |
| Local Tax Agreements                      | \$0.00101            | \$0.00102            | Local Tax Agreements                      | \$0.0010             | \$0.00102            |
| <b>Subtotal Municipal Rate</b>            | <b>\$1.0582</b>      | <b>\$1.0852</b>      | <b>Subtotal Municipal Rate</b>            | <b>\$1.0582</b>      | <b>\$1.0852</b>      |
| <b>Water &amp; Sewer Benefit Charge</b>   | <b>\$0.0200</b>      | <b>\$0.0200</b>      | <b>Water &amp; Sewer Benefit Charge</b>   | <b>\$0.0200</b>      | <b>\$0.0200</b>      |
| <b>Sewer Separation Charge</b>            | <b>\$0.0700</b>      | <b>\$0.0700</b>      | <b>Sewer Separation Charge</b>            | <b>\$0.0700</b>      | <b>\$0.0700</b>      |
| <b>Total Municipal Rate</b>               | <b>\$1.1482</b>      | <b>\$1.1752</b>      | <b>Total Municipal Rate</b>               | <b>\$1.1482</b>      | <b>\$1.1752</b>      |
| School                                    | \$1.6234             | \$1.6012             | School                                    | \$1.6295             | \$1.7116             |
| <b>TOTAL TAX RATE</b>                     | <b>\$2.7716</b>      | <b>\$2.7764</b>      | <b>TOTAL TAX RATE</b>                     | <b>\$2.7777</b>      | <b>\$2.8868</b>      |

**NOTE:**

\*Overall, the Grand List is up .17% which is less than the 0.5% projected increase.

\*The Municipal Tax Rate is up 2.70 cents (2.35%). This includes the funding for CVPSA & \$20,000 for Central Vermont Home Health & Hospice special articles.

\*Homestead Education Rates are down 2.2 cents (1.37%) and non-residential rates are up 8.21 cents (5.04%)

\*This is the fifth year of the Downtown Improvement District Tax - voters approved the rate of \$.0515 (same as prior year)

Total Tax Rates are up:

|                 |          |       |
|-----------------|----------|-------|
| Homestead       | \$0.0048 | 0.17% |
| Non-Residential | \$0.1091 | 3.93% |